



SUSAN J. BANDES¹
Michigan State University - bandes@msu.edu

ON ZURBARÁN, DALÍ AND NANCY F. MARINO

RESUMEN

Este artículo explora el arte admirado y enseñado por Nancy F. Marino. Susan J. Bandes, historiadora del arte y amiga, cuenta de los intereses mutuos en el Museo del Prado y otros sitios. Marino disfrutaba y aprovechaba de las obras clásicas españolas en el Eli and Edythe Broad Art Museum de Michigan State University. Aquí Bandes cuenta la historia de la adquisición por Martín Soria de *La visión de San Antonio de Padua* de Francisco de Zurbarán, el cuadro *San Sebastian* procedente del estudio de Zurbarán y *Remordamiento* de Salvador Dalí. También aporta nueva información sobre las tres obras. La influencia de Soria le proveía a Marino unos cuadros ejemplares para explorar la cultura, religión e historia de España.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Zurbarán, Dalí, Martin Soria, Madrid, Nancy F. Marino

ABSTRACT

This article explores the art that Nancy F. Marino knew, loved, and taught. As an art historian and her friend, Susan J. Bandes recounts mutual interests in the Prado Museum collection and elsewhere. At MSU, Marino took advantage of the strong Spanish holdings in the Broad Art Museum that date to the its founding. Martin Soria's role in acquiring *The Vision of St. Anthony* by Francisco Zurbarán, *St. Sebastian* by Zurbarán's studio, and Salvador Dalí's *Remorse* is discussed including new information about each painting. Soria's influence provided Marino with quintessential examples to explore Spanish culture, religion and history.

¹ Susan J. Bandes is Professor of Art History at Michigan State University and was Director of Museum Studies. She served as Director of the Kresge Art Museum (now the Eli and Edythe Broad Art Museum at MSU) from 1986 until 2010. She has published on Gaspard Dughet, a seventeen-century landscape painter in Rome, on Baroque painting, Old Master prints, and American Modernism. Her most recent book is *Mid-Michigan Modern: From Frank Lloyd Wright to Googie*, MSU Press, 2016. At Kresge, she curated numerous exhibitions encompassing Old Master paintings to contemporary art. She holds a Ph.D. in art history from Bryn Mawr College.

KEYWORDS: Zurbarán, Dalí, Martín Soria, Madrid, Nancy F. Marino

When I was asked to contribute to this special issue in memory of Nancy F. Marino and to write about her love of art, my head began to swim with images of my friend. As an art historian who teaches Renaissance and Baroque art, my field is peripheral to hers, but as humanists, we had much in common. Lots of memories relate to conversations over coffee and meals, in East Lansing, our home town, and in Madrid and Paris, where we travelled together. We also bonded as east coast transplants in mid-Michigan and talked of New York pizza, the Metropolitan Museum of Art, and other familiar places from our childhoods. Here I will consider our mutual interests in art in the Prado Museum as well as in highlights of the Spanish art collection in the Eli and Edythe Broad Art Museum (formerly Kresge Art Museum) at Michigan State University that she used in teaching to explore Spanish history and culture.

One cold winter day in early 2012, while doing an exercise class together, I lamented that I had not yet made spring break plans. She immediately invited me to stay with her in Madrid for the week. And that's how I ended up in Madrid that March, sharing experiences, conversation and camaraderie. Nancy was a creature of habits. She rented the same apartment many times in Madrid, which was many times. She went to the Biblioteca Nacional de España each day to read manuscripts while I headed to museums and historic sites. Each evening she would quiz me about what I had seen. She shared my excitement at studying Hieronymus Bosch's paintings in person. We discussed how you really *can* see all of the minute details that scholars discuss endlessly and that are reproduced on numerous tee shirts, mugs and cards. Given that Hendrik III of Nassau, the person who is believed to have commissioned the *Garden of Earthly Delights* in 1517 for his palace in Brussels, did so to elicit conversation amongst those privileged to see the paintings in his home, I had the sense that he would have been pleased by our continuing discourse.

Titian's portraits of the royal family were also of interest to us. Nancy wrote about the enormous equestrian portrait of Charles V commemorating his victory at the Battle of Mühlberg in the context of the emperor's propaganda agenda that included ballads, prints and sculpture. Details of the painting, including the colors used, the armor and setting, were informed by contemporary literature ('Ávila y Zúñiga's *Comentario*) while also referencing the mythic St. George and ancient Roman equestrian sculptures of victorious emperors (Marino 2014 43-45). As she wrote, the effectiveness of the "multi-media publicity campaign" as seen in Titian's image, reinforced the albeit exaggerated positive image of Charles V that continues even today for those who stand in front of the painting and then look around at later equestrian portraits of the royal family and their entourage by Diego Velázquez on display in the museum.

2012 was the year that the Prado's copy of the *Mona Lisa* was unveiled. Hidden in storage for centuries, there was a buzz about the discovery during conservation treatment that the black background was a later addition. Minus that background, the conservators unveiled a landscape very close to Leonardo's painting in the Louvre. Moreover, x-rays and detailed technical analysis showed compositional revisions that reflected Leonardo's changes, leading scholars to conclude that the Prado painting was contemporaneous with the Louvre's, done by one of Leonardo's unnamed studio assistants. As a copy that would remain in the studio after the portrait was transferred to the patron, it is quite close to the original but as scholar Martin Kemp said, there is a certain niggley-ness to it.² That didn't stop the crowds from ogling her in the Prado, as Nancy and I did. And we both agreed that while beautiful and informative, close looking at the Prado *Mona Lisa* provided a way to distinguish what makes the Louvre painting more mysterious, subtle and justly famous.

After reading Nancy's article about Queen Juana's scandalous behavior and garments (Marino 2001), I started to pay attention to historic Spanish fashion and the literature on the topic that considers the complexity of these garments, their evolution, and what they say about wealth, power and status (Colomar). Velasquez's *Las Meninas* was one of Nancy's favorite paintings. The style of the dresses worn by the Infanta Margarita Teresa and her attendants originated in the fifteenth-century *verdugo* that she wrote about. By the seventeenth century, the hoops of the underskirt moved well beyond the original cone shape to exaggerate the width of the female's hips. The farthingdale or *guarda infanta* worn by the Infanta reached unprecedented popularity in seventeenth-century Spain but by mid-century, it was viewed as old fashioned in the rest of Europe. Nevertheless, in Velasquez's complex painting, which has been the subject of innumerable art historical interpretations, few scholars have paid attention to the garments worn by the women. It doesn't surprise me that Nancy would turn her attention to fashion as she herself was always stylish. Moreover, one of her perpetual joys and constant activities was knitting. While this was something else we had in common, she was incredibly skilled, perfectly executing very difficult patterns. Often they were exceedingly intricate and lacey, reminding me of some of the lace collars and cuffs worn by women in Spanish paintings.

Each day of my Madrid stay, Nancy would list some of her favorite places for me to visit. These included side trips to Salamanca to pay homage to Cervantes, her most treasured Spanish author, and to Segovia, to walk the path of its lost Jewish heritage. In

² Martin Kemp on the Prado Mona Lisa, quoted in Bob Duggan, "What Does the Prado's Mona Lisa Copy Tell Us About the Real Thing?" *Big Think*, 24 Feb. 2012, accessed 3/17/19.

Madrid, in addition to the usual museums, she had a fondness for smaller, less visited places such as the Museo Lázaro Galdiano, a private house turned into a museum with a surprising collection of Bosch, Goya and numerous seventeenth-century Spanish paintings. Elsewhere in Europe, where she and her husband Frank McBath often travelled, she appreciated the Plantain-Moretus House in Antwerp, Belgium, and the Martin Bodmer Foundation in Cologny, Switzerland, both of which have significant collections of rare books and in the latter case, manuscripts. The Plantain Press, a UNESCO World Heritage Site, was founded in the sixteenth century, and became the largest, most successful and long-lived of Antwerp's book publishers. It was well known for publishing in 1568 the *Biblia Polyglotta*, a bible translated into five languages and lavishly illustrated with engravings. This necessitated a huge enterprise that eventually won the contract to print religious works for King Phillip II as well as for the papacy. The press thrived through the centuries because of its size and available capital, outliving many of the smaller presses in the city, including Martin Nuncio's (active from 1540-58) who printed books in Spanish. To see the Plantain's original printing presses, the sales room, extensive library, and the family's living quarters upstairs was indeed a treat for a scholar who devoted her life to literary production.

Nancy not only enjoyed looking at but also collecting art with her husband. They graduated from posters to Old Master prints including Jusepe Ribera's (1591-1652) etchings of *The Poet* and *The Flaying of St. Bartholemew*, Italian sixteenth-century prints of putti, and a print from Jacques Callot's (1592-1635) *Gobbi* series circa 1612. The *Gobbi* depict grotesque, fat, misshapen and contorted dwarves. These and other Callot prints such as the *Miseries of War* were to influence Goya, another of Nancy's favorite painters, especially the black paintings in the Prado. She owned examples from Goya's *The Prisoners* and *Caprichios* series. Other nineteenth-century examples she collected included one of Jacques Tissot's (1836-1902) elegant French women and five mezzotints by the Danish artist Peter Ilsted (1861-1933). These quiet, meditative and moody images depict shadowed corners of rooms where women read, sew, knit and practice piano, all things that Nancy enjoyed. She also acquired several manuscript pages with beautiful calligraphic flourishes that were framed and hung in their home.

In her interdisciplinary courses on Spanish history and culture at Michigan State University, Nancy encouraged her students to become familiar with Spanish art and, luckily, the university art museum has significant examples she took her students to see. The Kresge Art Museum became the Eli and Edythe Broad Art Museum in 2010 when it moved into a striking contemporary building designed by Zaha Hadid. Although the Old Master paintings are no longer on view, with special arrangements we could still introduce our students to art of the period.

One of the most important paintings in the collection is *The Vision of St. Anthony* attributed to Francisco Zurbarán (1598-1664), circa 1635-1640 (Fig. 1). It was also the first painting to be purchased in February 1960 for the new museum.³ At that time Dr. Martin S. Soria (1911-1961), a well-known scholar of Spanish seventeenth-century art, was on the MSU faculty.⁴ He was instrumental in the development of the museum and its early acquisitions. He persuaded the then-President of MSU, John Hannah, to acquire the Zurbarán, countering the objection to purchasing a religious painting for a secular institution. Soria argued that this was an unprecedented opportunity to help form the direction of the holdings, which had been envisioned as specializing in twentieth-century (that is, contemporary) American art. To raise the necessary funds, many people in the community provided support for the acquisition.⁵ Until Soria's tragic death in a plane crash in Brussels on 15 February 1961 en route to an international conference, he had a strong influence on the Spanish holdings. These include a large seated wood Spanish (or Southern French) bishop from the late fourteenth-century (Smith 73-78), and a wood choir-stall panel from Cadiz, attributed to the circle of Andrés de Nájera from the first quarter of the sixteenth century that was donated to the museum by Soria's widow (Heath in Stratton 90-91 # 6). These featured in the tours that Nancy gave to her students at the museum.

The acquisition of *St. Anthony* made the *New York Times* "Notable Acquisitions in American Museums," 27 March 1960. By then Soria had completed his dissertation on Zurbarán and was considered the leading expert on the painter. In 1955 the British architectural historian Nicolas Pevsner made Soria aware of *St. Anthony* in the collection of Lord Wraxall, housed in Tyntesfield, his British country mansion in Wraxall, Bristol. It has been traced back to the collection of Francisco Romero de Balsameda in Seville in the early 19th century. Nigel Glendinning identifies it next in the collection of Julian Benjamin Williams, a British consul in Seville from 1831 through 1856 (121). He and other important nineteenth-century British collectors in Spain benefited from the

³ "MSU Acquires Painting" states the purchase price of \$24,000, that President Hannah "hoped it would mark the beginning of a large collection of quality art work at MSU," and that the painting could be used to teach humanities courses, which all MSU students are required to take, instead of using book illustrations and slides of the great period of Western art. The acquisition was also listed in *College Art Journal*, 19.1 (Spring 1960) 259, fig. 8.

⁴ Soria's brief biography is included in Sorensen. He received his BA degree from the University of Madrid in 1933 and his PhD in art history from Harvard University in 1949. He began teaching at MSU as a visiting instructor in 1948. He published on Spanish seventeenth-century art as well as Latin and South American art.

⁵ Broad Art Museum, accession number 59.29. Measurements: 180.34 x 113.03 cm. MSU purchase, funded by the MSU Development Fund; Motor Wheel Corporation; Michigan National Bank; J. W. Knapp Co.; Gladys Olds Anderson; Mr. and Mrs. James F. Anderton; Mr. and Mrs. Harold F. Gross; Mr. and Mrs. Robert C. Lindell; Mr. and Mrs. Howard Stoddard; Mr. and Mrs. Clarence S. Roe.

suppression of religious orders in 1835-36 and the secularization of religious property. Between 1835 and 1841, the confiscated property from religious institutions of twelve people or fewer came on the market (Glendinning 117). In the 1830s and early 1840s, Williams amassed what was considered one of the finest private collections in Seville, until it was sold by 1844 (Glendinning 121 and nn24, 25). He owned examples by Velasquez, Bartolomeo Esteban Murillo (1617-1682), probably the Broad's *St Anthony*, and, until 1832, Zurbarán's well-known *Martyrdom of St. Serapion*, 1628, now in the Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Connecticut.

Subsequently, *St. Anthony* was one of a large group of paintings purchased by William Gibbs, a British businessman, when he and his wife visited Seville in 1853. A painting of *St. Lawrence holding his Gridiron and crowned by a putto* attributed to Juan Luis Zambrano (1598-1639) was likely acquired at this time as well.⁶ Gibbs had purchased a country estate in Wraxall in 1843 and had it extensively remodeled and expanded in the 1860s. Known as Tyntesfield, the house and its furnishings were inherited by family members. Following the 2001 death of William Gibbs' great-grandson, the property was sold to the National Trust the following year. *St. Lawrence* remained in the house where it can be seen today as part of the Trust's collection.⁷ *St. Anthony*, however, was consigned by the Wraxall family to Frost and Reed Ltd., a London dealer, in the middle of the 20th century.⁸ From there it went to W. R. Fine Galleries, in Dallas, 1948, where it was purchased by John T. Sanders, a private collector. In 1960, this gallery handled the sale that transferred the painting to MSU.

The vision of St. Anthony was a very popular subject in seventeenth-century Spain. It was painted at least three times by Jusepe Ribera, twice by Murillo including in 1656 for Seville Cathedral, by Alonso Cano (1601-1667), and Juan de Valdés Leal (1622-1690).⁹ It was also depicted in seventeenth-century Italian prints by Elisabetta Sirani, Simone Cantarini, Domenico Piola, and Giulio Carpioni. Unlike his numerous images of St. Francis, Zurbarán is known to have painting only a few versions and additional

⁶ Zambrano is discussed in Delenda, II: 2010, 267-273. However, the Tyntesfield painting is not included nor does it relate stylistically to her examples. Zurbarán's *St. Lawrence*, 1636, now in the Hermitage in St. Petersburg (Delenda, I, #112), and another in the Museo de Bellas Artes, Cadiz, 1638-39 (Delenda, I, #129) differ substantially from this one.

⁷ In 2011, the National Trust purchased a Mater Dolorosa by the studio of Murillo that had apparently been part of the collection and returned it to Tyntesfield. "Old Master back in Tyntesfield's great hall... after 100 years," *Western Daily Press*, 29 Mar. 2011; accessed 3/12/19.

⁸ Letter from George Richard Lawley Gibbs, 2nd Lord Wraxall (1928-2001), 16 Mar. 1976 to Fay L. Hendry, in Hendry n1. Gibbs erroneously attributes the Zambrano to Zurbarán.

⁹ Stoichita, 125-132, on the evolution of the theme from El Greco to Murillo.

examples are attributed to his studio.¹⁰ Images of St. Anthony typically focus on the full-length figure of the saint clothed in heavy monastic garb, kneeling or standing. While in the sixteenth century, Anthony's role as a preacher was emphasized, by the seventeenth century, the focus changed to the miraculous vision he had of the Christ child while saying his prayers in a friend's house in southern France. A prayer book is always included in the images. Anthony may hold it, perhaps insert a finger to mark his place or it might be closed or open on a nearby surface. A stalk of white lilies reflecting his humility and purity is also always present. The Christ child sometimes appears in the heavens and other times close to Anthony who reaches out to touch him or even cradle him in his arms. These portrayals of the momentary vision demonstrate the increasing importance of meditation, and the intermingling of heavenly and earthly spheres.

In the Broad painting, Anthony, who is crowned by a barely visible gold halo, kneels beside a simple *prie-dieu* upon which are his prayer book and lilies. With watery eyes, he gazes up to witness the heavens as they open to reveal the young Christ child seated in the golden burst of clouds. As Martin Soria explained, the mature and meditative look of the child, the cross in his hand, and his reddish mantle of the Passion, refer to his future sacrifice (*MSU Acquires Painting*). This scene takes place in a vague interior with a heavy blue-green curtain that is pulled back to reveal the landscape and sky beyond on the right through an opening. The fall of the curtain echoes the circular clouds around Christ, and the broad curves of Anthony's habit. Two light sources are used; the miraculous golden yellow and red glow around Christ that illuminates the interior, creating the dramatic light and shade that falls on St. Anthony, and the daylight beyond.

Jonathan Brown was the first to publish the Broad version, dating it circa 1630-33, as an example of post-Counter Reformation art that emphasized contemplation, mysticism and the importance of prayer (1973 84 pl. 13).¹¹ In *Saint Anthony of Padua*, dated 1630-35, discovered by Odile Delenda in the Church of Saint Romain in Etremham, France, and published by her in 2005, there are similarities in the dominant compositional diagonal from upper left to lower right and the Christ child is of the same type with

¹⁰ Delenda lists two in I; in Etremham, 186-189, # 42, and in the Museu de Arte in Sao Paolo, 211- 212, # 50. The latter depicts a kneeling St. Anthony with his book on the ground, next to two open and two closed lilies. His hands are clasped and his head is covered by the hood. A minute Christ appears in the upper left. Delenda, II, includes the Broad painting (attributed to his workshop, # II-175) plus two other St. Anthony's attributed to followers, 429-430 (# II-176, 177). She writes that another version of the Broad painting is in a private collection in Jerez de la Frontera.

¹¹ Brown included the same text in the condensed version, *Zurbarán*, 1991, 66-67. The illustration is prior to the 1993 conservation treatment and shows the heavy black lines especially on the fingers, which were the results of a prior restoration.

curly blond hair.¹² In the Etreham painting, he stands wearing an oversized pinkish tunic whereas in the Broad painting, he is seated with his chest and legs uncovered while a pinkish-red cloth swirls behind him and a whitish material modestly covers his masculinity. Both Saints Anthony wear the Friars Minor gray-brown ample and loose tunic with wide sleeves, a knotted rope belt and a hooded cowl. The slightly younger and less boney Broad Saint Anthony, however, is turned several degrees towards the viewer, revealing more of his face and front, and he has put his book aside to meditate on the vision. Scholars point to Zurbarán's frequent use of printed images for his compositions and the somewhat awkward placement of Christ's right hand may be explained by its connection to an as-yet unidentified print source.¹³ Likewise, Zurbarán would have been familiar with numerous painted wooden sculptures of saints found in Spanish churches. The weight of the garments and the deep creases of its folds echo polychrome sculptural examples.

Born in Fuente de Cantos, Badajoz, Zurbarán was apprenticed in Seville and started his career there in the first quarter of the century. A wealthy city, it had an expanding religious community that provided a lucrative market for large-scale commissions. In Seville, he also met Velasquez, who was responsible for inviting him to Madrid in 1634 to participate in the decoration of Buen Retiro. Unfortunately, this brought him neither the fame nor commissions he had envisioned and so he returned to Seville. By 1640, however, the economic situation in the city was changing. There were fewer monastic commissions, and Bartolomé Esteban Murillo's newer, softer more refined style was coming into vogue. As a result, Zurbarán turned to selling his paintings in the New World, to more or less success, and he, too, softened his style. He returned to Madrid in 1658 and remained there until his death in 1664.¹⁴ Dates proposed for the Broad *St. Anthony* range from 1630-35 in Seville, or later in Madrid, or perhaps it was executed by

¹² Delenda, 2005, 243-248. In her discussion of the Etreham *St. Anthony* in I, 186-189, #42, (as well as in Delenda and Borobia, 104), she states that references in documents to his paintings depicting St. Anthony are scarce and that it is possible that this could be the painting of Saint Anthony with the Christ child referred to by Amador de Las Ríos in 1844 (1979, 473), in his description of Julian Williams' collection in Seville. However, Glendinning, 121, connects de Las Ríos' mention to the MSU painting, suggesting that Gibbs purchased it from Williams. Although the Etreham painting had not yet been discovered when Glendinning wrote, we know from Lord Wraxall's letter to Hendry that the Broad painting was purchased by Gibbs in Seville in 1853, thus adumbrating Glendinning's provenance.

¹³ Hendry, 5, speculates that this awkwardness may be due to adapting the position from a composition in which a child is held in someone's arms. On Zurbarán's reliance on prints, in particular Flemish and German 16th century examples, see Benito Navarrete Prieto, "Concerning Wit, Ingenuity, and Copying: Zurbarán, Creator of Sacred Images," in Delenda and Borobia, 45-51. He also discusses the use of prints in Zurbarán's workshop to make multiple copies of an original painting.

¹⁴ For a brief history of his life and style, see Jonathan Brown in Baticle, 1-24.

someone in his workshop.¹⁵ Nevertheless, it is an excellent example of the type of subject and style that made Zurbarán famous and sought after in his time; quiet devotional images of single saints in meditation illuminated with dramatic light, and modeled with Caravaggesque chiaroscuro.

The Broad *St. Anthony* underwent several restorations over the centuries. At one time, the Christ child had been painted over and was revealed in 1950 when Lord Wraxall had it cleaned. By then, there was also water damage on the right side as a result of the vicissitudes of war suffered at Tyntesfield.¹⁶ An extensive and lengthy treatment was undertaken in 1993 at the Detroit Institute of Arts Conservation Lab, during which time I became familiar with every inch of the surface as well as what was underneath, visible in x-rays. These confirmed that Christ's awkward right arm is indeed Zurbarán's original composition. Elsewhere, they showed that Zurbarán changed his mind about the placement of Anthony's left hand and the garment covering his throat, which originally was more exposed. Zurbarán often made minor adjustments as he was painting and a number of other paintings have similar *pentimenti*. These original thoughts would have been painted over by the artist but as the top layers become transparent over time in the natural aging process of oil painting, they reveal what is underneath. When Zurbarán revised the elongated and open position of the hand to a slightly closed gesture, he created a parallel between Anthony's hand and Christ's right hand, strengthening the connection between them. Nancy and I discussed the pros and cons of covering up or leaving the *pentimento* visible, and ultimately, concurred that it was enlightening to see and understand the artist's thought processes.

Another consequence of the aging of paint is that the tonal relationships of some colors including greens and browns become less distinct. This is evident in the darker areas of the painting where the distant trees are more brown than green and the edge of the floor and the start of the wall have become muddled. In this case, the conservator made no attempt to get back to the artist's original color or intent. On the other hand, dark dense black lines that outlined the joints of the fingers and other details that had

¹⁵ Delenda, 2005, 246, errs in stating that the Broad painting, which is in East Lansing, is in the University of Michigan's collection in Ann Arbor, Michigan. This is repeated in II, 429. To her, it is a later version done by Zurbarán's workshop after a lost original. She defines *obrador*, or workshop production as being realized in the artist's studio with some supervision but no participation of the master, II, 22. Likewise, Gállego, 94, #216 and 260, fig. 234, places the painting in "Wichita Falls: Midwestern University." Based on Delenda's confusion between Michigan State University and the University of Michigan, and Gállego's error, it is doubtful that either had seen the Broad painting in person. Gállego's book is prior to the 1993 conservation and the image Delenda reproduced appears to be prior to the conservation treatment as well. Therefore, both attributions to Zurbarán's workshop should be reconsidered.

¹⁶ Letter from Gibbs to Hendry, n1.

probably been added in the nineteenth century were removed. Additionally, paint had disintegrated in the area of the uppermost petals of the top lily and below it in a vertical line. Perhaps lit candles on the altar in front of the painting caused the surface to have burned or overheated. As a result, there was little original paint left in this area and it was in-painted by the conservator as were other small losses. The conservation project confirmed that on top of a base ground layer of white lead in oil, Zurbarán applied a two-toned *imprimatura* (or first paint layer) and then additional paint layers. The *imprimatura* is a greyish color in the upper portion while it is red-brown below. This follows Zurbarán's typical way of painting found in other examples and allowed him to easily and quickly achieve overall dark and light passages.¹⁷ Areas of impasto in the highlights had been flattened as a result of previous relinings and the surface around the Christ child is abraded, undoubtedly caused by the black paint that covered him up.¹⁸ Once the discolored varnish was removed and replaced, the quality and delicacy of the painting could be appreciated. The result of the project was to reveal areas that clearly show the hallmarks of Zurbarán's style including the nuanced tonal treatment of beige, brown, grey and ochre in the garment, the sensitive play of light and shade, and the beautifully rendered still life details of the prayer book and the lilies. Because it is the quintessential monastic image for which Zurbarán became famous, Nancy appreciated being able to show students not just his style but a representative example of Spanish Baroque Counter-Reformation religious imagery.

Zurbarán was Martin Soria's specialty. In the late 1950s in Spain, he purchased a painting for himself of St. Sebastian that he originally attributed to Zurbarán but changed to Bernabé de Ayala, a little-known pupil of the master (Fig. 2). It hung in the dining room of the family home in East Lansing and was donated to the museum by his widow in 2000.¹⁹ Until its transfer to the museum, it had not been seen in public and since then, it has been published only once (Stratton-Pruitt 68 fig. 49). It depicts a full-length youthful, nude St. Sebastian. His raised right arm is tied above his head to a tree limb and his left arm hangs behind this side. His torso is covered by a loosely draped white cloth and his legs straddle the trunk of a tree. He gazes upward with his mouth slightly open. His shaded face is ruddy, his cheeks and the tip of his nose are reddened, and

¹⁷ Véliz discusses Zurbarán's technique in the context of Francisco Pacheco's *El Arte de la pintura*, which recorded contemporary Sevillian painting techniques. She also explains Zurbarán's simplified method that made it easy for his assistants to copy and emulate.

¹⁸ Barbara Heller, Survey Condition Report (12/10/90) and Treatment Essay (12/1993), Conservation Services Laboratory, Detroit Institute of Arts; Broad Art Museum collection file.

¹⁹ Gift of Marion Soria in memory of Martin Soria, 2000.21.1. Measurements: 107.95 x 52.7cm. It was lined and revarnished in 1960 according to label on the back but the varnish is uneven and there are a number of paint losses. Broad Art Museum collection file.

his hair and mustache are dark. Strong light from the upper left illuminates the right side of the body. The body is pierced with arrows and splotted with blood; it was not the easiest image to dine with each meal, as the Soria family recounted. The face and muscular body are strikingly realistic. Several scholars who have seen photographs of the painting confirm an attribution to Zurbarán's school and a date of circa 1650 or later but there is no consensus as to who the artist might be.²⁰

St. Sebastian had been a popular subject for several centuries. Sixteenth-century German prints by Dürer and Schongauer typically show a healthy, muscled older man struggling against death. Sometimes his hands are raised and tied together, or tied behind his back, and often his legs are tied to the tree. Of Zurbarán's contemporaries, Ribera did several versions. His 1624 print depicts an elderly man, fallen on his knees, while in the 1652 half-length painting in the Prado, the arms are in the same position as the Broad's figure. However, Ribera's figures are wiry and strained, and more wracked with violence. Zurbarán painted only one St. Sebastian, dated 1650-55, and moreover, he rarely painted nudes other than representing Christ on the cross several times, including the early example in the Art Institute of Chicago (1627), the *Apparition of St. Peter to St. Peter Nolasco* (1629) in the Prado, and the series of ten paintings of the Labors of Hercules commissioned for the Hall of Realms in the Buen Retiro Palace in Madrid in 1634. In Zurbarán's *St. Sebastian*, (Delenda II 618) the thin-bodied saint with long dark hair has each arm tied to a tree limb at waist height. He also straddles the large tree trunk but his bent body forms a large curve that is more skeletal than muscular. Like the Broad St. Sebastian, he, too, is seen against a natural setting of rocks and mountains and is modeled with chiaroscuro. The Broad St. Sebastian, with his youthful, taut, and muscular body, denies his impending death and martyrdom. Further research may identify the artist of the painting and a cleaning would help to reveal the beautiful passages of painting that are only hinted at in the current condition. As another example of emotional baroque imagery and seventeenth-century technique, Nancy used this graphic painting in her classes to illustrate Spanish religion and culture.

More recent Spanish art in the Broad collection includes a stellar example from Salvador Dalí's most innovative and critically acclaimed period of the 1930s. *Remorse or Sphinx Embedded in the Sand* is a meticulously painted small oil painting on canvas dated 1931 (Fig. 3).²¹ In it a blond-haired woman seen from the back, is half buried in the sand in the lower left. Her torso and head, which rests on her raised right hand, cast a large,

²⁰ Broad Art Museum collection file. Delenda II set about the huge task of sorting out Zurbarán's workshop and followers in her catalogue raisonnée, yet, none seems to be the painter of this painting.

²¹ Gift of John Wolfram, 61.8. Measurements: 19.05 x 26.67cm.

long dark shadow on the ground. The barren landscape stretches towards the horizon to an outcropping of mountains that recall Dalí's native Catalonia. Various surreal details abound; under her skin are a woman's shoe and a glass of milk, popular fetishes that Dalí frequently used, and beside her is an eggshape on the ground. The painting is signed "Olive Salvador Dalí." Olive was the nickname Dalí gave to his new wife Gala, appropriate as he explained in *The Secret Life of Salvador Dalí* 1942 (VI), because of her oval face and the color of her skin.

Remorse is a beloved painting that is well published and has been exhibited internationally.²² Martin Soria had a hand in the painting's donation to Kresge. *Remorse* was first exhibited at the Julien Levy Gallery in New York in 1933 and sold the following year to Frank Crowninshield.²³ In September 1937, it was purchased by Virginia Nelson for \$350 from Feragil, a New York gallery. Upon her death in January 1954, her sons Sam Woodridge and Burnham Nelson inherited it.²⁴ Sam's wife Dana worked for Michigan State University and when they needed money, she asked the Art Department to purchase the painting for \$2,000 but no acquisition funds were available. John Wolfram, who was the Vice President of General Motors and General Manager of Oldsmobile, which were headquartered in Lansing, Michigan, stepped in to purchase the painting on the condition that he keep it for four years and then give it to the university.²⁵ A generous philanthropist, Wolfram collected art by artists who intrigued him but also assisted the university in building its collection. Martin Soria was asked to evaluate the painting and on 2 June 1960, he wrote to Mrs. Woodbridge that it "admirably represents him at the height of his surrealist period.... I have known Mr. Dalí personally, as well as his work, since 1936, have met him a number of times, and own one of his etchings, given me by the artist. Having advised many museums, including the Art Institute of Chicago, the Detroit Institute of Art, the National Gallery, etc., in the field of Spanish painting, I am happy to confirm the quality and the authenticity of your picture."²⁶

When Mr. Wolfram wrote to the head of the Art Department on that same date, the purchase arrangement was modified to a price of \$1,500 "with the understanding that I will allow the University to display the painting at least four months a year and that I will donate it to Michigan State University within five years at the then appraised

²² Among the recent publications for exhibitions are: Bradley 65 (detail), # 13; Ades, #94; Gale, 84, il. 47.

²³ Riddell describes and illustrates this painting with the title "Remorse," in "Dalí- The Surrealist," about an exhibition at the Julien Levy Gallery in New York. Cody, 6-7, illustrates it "courtesy of Frank Crowninshield Collection."

²⁴ Letter from Sam Woodridge to Fay Hendry, 12 Sept. 1974; Broad collection files.

²⁵ Letter from Paul Love, Kresge Art Gallery Director, to the Salvador Dalí Archives, 1 Nov. 1973; Broad collection file.

²⁶ Letter from Martin R. Soria to Mrs. Dana M. Woodbridge, East Lansing, 2 June 1960; Broad collection file.

evaluation.”²⁷ Clearly, this was to provide the maximum tax benefit to Wolfram but in 1961, he donated the painting outright. The studio art faculty in the early 1960s was primarily abstract painters including Charles Pollock, the elder brother of Jackson Pollock. Most wanted little to do with Surrealism or representational art, and without Soria’s intervention and support, the painting might have been rejected. As one of the best known and published works in the collection, it was provident that Soria prevailed and expanded the Spanish holdings into contemporary art.²⁸

Numerous broad-ranging interpretations of the painting have been offered over the years encompassing Freudian analysis, dream imagery, and unleashing the unconscious and the irrational. Recent exhibitions in which the painting was included explored the relationship between Dalí and film (Gale 84 ill. 47),²⁹ the meaning and extensive use of shadows in Surrealism (Lanthy 114), and the influence of Spanish Baroque painting on Dalí’s art (Stratton-Pruitt). What is evident in this painting is the feeling of isolation and despair tinged with eroticism, and the haunting, unending landscape. The ominous shadow is as much the subject of the painting as the woman. It occupies even more space than she does and is as concrete and solid as her body (Lanthy 114). A common theme in Dalí’s work is the sense of death, implied here in the greenish tone of the woman’s skin and her partial burial in the sand. The blue-green tones also suggest an equation to sea and sand, or burial in the sea of the subconscious. The “sexual instinct” is symbolized by the shoe and the glass of milk caught between flesh and clinging robe. Dalí also related Gala/Olive to Gradiva, the heroine of a short story by Wilhelm Jensen he analyzed at this time and popularized in his imagery (Bradley 65 # 13). Dalí encouraged ambiguity and multiple ways of reading his paintings, which seems at odds with the precise way in which they are painted. By juxtaposing the minute with the infinite, and the real with the unreal, images such as this can relate to the tradition of Spanish religious paintings also seen in the Broad’s *Vision of St. Anthony*. In both, the mix of naturalism and the supernatural are manifest in quiet, melancholic and meditative images. Yet, a significant difference is the clarity and sincerity of the baroque image and the confounding message of the later work.

If Soria’s life had not been cut short, I am certain that he and Nancy would have had numerous interesting discussions. I feel privileged to have had occasions for many of

²⁷ Letter from J. F. Wolfram to Mr. Howard Church, head of the Department of Art, 2 June 1960. Wolfram references discussing this arrangement with Lindsey Decker, then a painting faculty member; Broad collection file.

²⁸ It is catalogue number 268 in the online *catalogue raisonné* of Salvador Dalí, published by the Gala-Salvador Dalí Foundation, with an extensive listing of exhibitions and publications.

²⁹ The exhibition was at the Tate Modern (London), LACMA, Salvador Dalí Museum, St. Petersburg, Florida, Museum of Modern Art, New York, 2007-2008.

them with her. We often shared meals at local mid-Michigan ethnic restaurants but the best were at their home. Nancy effortlessly whipped up elaborate Italian pastas, breads and desserts, odes to her Italian heritage. These were accompanied by Frank's selections of fine wines. Limoncello they made together would be offered with a bottle to take home. I salute Nancy whose life was too brief but who left a significant footprint in many ways—in her scholarship, teaching and friendships.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ades, Dawn, Michael R. Taylor, and Montserrat Aguer. *Dalí*. New York: Rizzoli, 2004.
- Baticle, Jeannine. *Zurbarán*. New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1987.
- Bradley, Fiona and Dawn Ades. *Salvador Dalí: A Mythology*. London: Tate Gallery, 1998.
- Brown, Jonathan. *Zurbarán*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, 1973.
- Brown, Jonathan. *Zurbarán*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, 1991.
- Cody, Morrill. "Dalí and the New Art", *Art and Artists of Today* 1.6 (1938): 6-7.
- Colomar, José Luis and Amalia Descalzo. *Spanish Fashion at the Courts of Early Modern Europe*. Madrid: CEEH (Centro de Estudios Europa Hispánica), 2014.
- Dalí, Salvador. *The Secret Life of Salvador Dalí* (transl. by Haakon Chevalier). New York: Dial Press, 1942.
- Delenda, Odile. "San Antonio de Padua: un Zurbarán inédito recuperado en Normandia", *Goya* 307-8 (June-October 2005): 243-248.
- Delenda, Odile with Almudena Ros de Barbero. *Francisco de Zurbarán, 1598-1664*. Vol. I. *Zurbarán. Catálogo razonada y crítico*. Madrid: Fundación Arte Hispánico, 2009. Vol. II: *Zurbarán. Los conjuntos y el obrador*. Madrid: Fundación Arte Hispánico, 2010.
- Delenda, Odile and Guerrero M. M. Borobia. *Zurbarán: A New Perspective*. Madrid: Fundación Colección-Thyssen Bornemisza, 2015.
- Gale, Matthew, Dawn Ades, Montserrat Aguer, and Fèlix Fanés. *Dalí & Film*. New York: Museum of Modern Art, 2007.
- Gallego, Julián and José Gudiol. *Zurbarán, 1598-1664*. London: Secker & Warburg, 1977.
- Glendinning, Nigel. "Nineteenth-Century British Envoys in Spain and the Taste for Spanish Art in England," *Burlington Magazine* 131.1031 (Feb. 1989): 117-126.
- Hendry, Fay L. "Zurbarán's Vision of St. Anthony", *Kresge Art Center Bulletin*, IX.5 (June 1976): 4-9.
- Kubler, George and Martin Soria. *Art and Architecture in Spain and Portugal and Their American Dominions, 1500-1800*. Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin Books, 1959.
- Lanthony, Philippe. *Lumière, vision et peinture*. Paris: Citadelles & Mazenod, 2009.
- Marino, Nancy F. "How the Portuguese Dame Scandalized the Court", *Essays in Medieval Studies* 18 (2001): 43-52.
- Marino, Nancy F. "The 'Romance de Carlos V' and the Emperor's Imperial Propaganda Machine", *Caliope: Journal of the Society of Renaissance and Baroque Hispanic Poetry*, 19.2 (2014): 35-49.
- "MSU Acquires Painting by Zurbarán", *Michigan State News* 51.138 Feb. 12, 1960: 1.
- Riddell, John. "A Byrd in the hand", *Vanity Fair* Feb. 1935: 49.
- Smith, Molly Teasdale. "A Gothic Woodcarving in the MSU Collection", *Selections from the Kresge Art Center Bulletin*, ed. Paul Love. East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University, 1974. 73-78.

- Sorensen, Lee, ed.. "Soria, Martin S." *Dictionary of Art Historians*, <http://arthistorians.info/soriam>.
- Soria, Martin. *The Paintings of Zurbarán*. London: Phaidon Press, 1953; 2nd ed., 1955.
- Stoichita, Victor I. *Visionary Experiences in the Golden Age of Spanish Art*. London: Reaktion Books, 1995.
- Stratton, Suzanne L. *Spanish Polychrome Sculpture 1500-1800 in United States Collections*, New York: Spanish Institute, 1994.
- Stratton-Pruitt, Suzanne. *Dali and The Spanish Baroque*. St. Petersburg, FL: Dalí Museum, 2007.
- Véliz, Zahira. "A Painter's Technique: Zurbarán's The Holy House of Nazareth", *The Bulletin of the Cleveland Museum of Art* 68. 8 (1981): 271-285.

APPENDIX



Fig. 1. Francisco de Zurbarán (Spanish, 1598-1664)

The Vision of St. Anthony of Padua

ca. 1635, Oil on canvas, 180.34 x 113.03 cm.

Broad Art Museum, MSU purchase, funded by the MSU Development Fund;
Motor Wheel Corp.; Michigan National Bank; J.W. Knapp Co.; Gladys Olds Anderson;
Mr. and Mrs. James F. Anderton; Mr. and Mrs. Harold F. Gross; Mr. and Mrs. Robert C.
Lindell; Mr. and Mrs. Howard Stoddard; Mr. and Mrs. Clarence S. Roe, 59.29



Fig. 2. School of Francisco de Zurbarán (Spanish, 17th century)
Formerly attributed to Bernabé de Ayala (Spanish, c. 1625-1689)

Saint Sebastian, ca. 1650, Oil on canvas, 95 x 52,7 cm.

Broad Art Museum, Gift of Marion Soria in memory of Martin Soria, 2000.21.1



Fig. 3. Salvador Dalí (Spanish, 1904-1989)
Remorse, or Sphinx Embedded in the Sand, 1931
Oil on canvas, (19.05 x 26.7 cm)
Broad Art Museum, Gift of John F. Wolfram, 61.8
© Salvador Dalí, Fundació Gala-Salvador Dalí, VEGAP, 2019